

# Translation of Nonstandard Language and Readability: Analysis of Joseph's Speech in an Indonesian version of *Wuthering Heights*

Andika Wijaya

## *Abstract*

*Nonstandard language varieties have long been used in literary works for a number of reasons. Translating nonstandard language varieties, however, can be challenging due to differences in what is considered nonstandard in different language systems and due to the socio-cultural information they contain. This study identifies the strategy, along with its benefits and drawbacks, adopted by A. Rahartati Bambang Haryo, the Indonesian translator of *Wuthering Heights*, one of the classic literary works famous for their use of different English language varieties. Data from the original work and the Indonesian version published by Qanita Publishing (2011) are analyzed by referring to the nonstandard language markers proposed by Englund Dimitrova (2014). The study finds that Haryo adopted the standardization strategy, which makes the markedness of Joseph's speech and the socio-cultural information it conveys absent in the translation. Nonetheless, the readability of the translated novel improves significantly, particularly the parts originally written in nonstandard English varieties.*

**Keywords:** Dialect translation, linguistic markers, nonstandard language, sociolinguistics, translation strategy, *Wuthering Heights*.

## 1. Introduction

Rhetorical use of nonstandard language has been identified as a common feature in a number of English literary works written in the Victorian era (Ilhem 2013). The notion of nonstandard language itself refers to a style of language that departs from the one officially recognized and accepted in one language community, taking different forms across different languages (Lung 2000: 268). These might include, among others, orthographical, morphosyntactic, and speech variants of the concerned language. One example of nonstandard language is the use of accent and dialect, which are typically linked to certain geographical settings of the communication and/or social information about speakers (Perteghella 2012).

*Wuthering Heights* is an English literature classic famous, or infamous, for its use of nonstandard language. In fact, this novel has been frequently used as an object of research to study the use of nonstandard English in literary texts (Ferguson 1998; Wiltshire 2005; Varghese 2012; Ilhem 2013; Hodson 2016). The figure in the novel that became the research interest of such studies is Joseph, a minor character who speaks with a thick Yorkshire accent. Despite the arguably accurate rendition of Yorkshire dialect, the nonstandard language varieties used mainly by Joseph might be difficult to understand even by native English readers, especially those not familiar with the dialect (Brontë quoted in Ferguson 1998; Hodson 2016). Due to this difficulty in understanding Joseph's speeches, it is common even among English readers to skip over them (Hodson 2016), especially given that Joseph is a minor character who has little impact on the story. However, Ferguson (1998: 4) notes that

Joseph's dialect does more than just establish his character; it has become an essential part of shaping the fictional world of *Wuthering Heights* and developing the social critiques conveyed through the novel. To help readers comprehend Joseph's dialogs and thus get a complete understanding of the story, nowadays some publishers of this English classic include a rendition of Joseph's dialogs in modern Standard English.

To date, there have been only two Indonesian translations of *Wuthering Heights*. The first one was published by Gramedia Pustaka Utama in 2011 with Lulu Wijaya as the translator, while the second one was published by Qanita Publishing in the same year with A. Rahartati Bambang Haryo as the translator. Since the former one was no longer reprinted nor available in bookstores, the current study only focuses on the latter version. While there is a future plan to also conduct a study on former, rarer version, the current study only investigates how A. Rahartati Bambang Haryo, one of the Indonesian translators of *Wuthering Heights*, addresses translation issues arising from Joseph's nonstandard language varieties in the second Indonesian version, which kept the original English title.

Translating nonstandard language, particularly in literary works, has always been quite challenging for translators. Whether for establishing a character, regional atmosphere, or social differences among characters, authors have their own reasons and purposes for using nonstandard language variations. Nonetheless, as Lung (2000: 267) suggests, it is not rare for translators to simply "disregard nonstandard language which is used to convey extra-linguistic information in the original." The study attempts to answer the following questions: (1) What are the challenges that might be faced by the Indonesian translator in translating Joseph's marked manner of speech; (2) What translation strategies are adopted to address such issues; (3) What are the benefits and/or drawbacks of such strategies. The answers to these questions are expected to provide translators with some choices of strategies to solve the problems in translating non-standard language and to justify the application of such strategies.

To answer these questions, the study first analyzes the dialect markers suggested by Englund Dimitrova (2004) and used in Joseph's speeches in the original English version published by Wordsworth Editions. It then compares some of Joseph's speeches in the original English version with the Indonesian rendition published by Qanita Publishing. The study investigates whether there is any attempt to retain the markedness of Joseph's language and the means by which such markedness, if any, is reflected in the Indonesian version. Based on the comparison between the two versions, the study examines whether the Indonesian version demonstrates any of the translation tendencies suggested by Englund Dimitrova (1997) and/or any particular dialect translation strategy proposed by Perteghella (2012).

This paper begins with a discussion of theoretical frameworks concerning dialect markers and dialect translation strategies. Next follows analysis of dialect markers and the adopted translation strategy. Finally, the paper answers the aforementioned research questions.

## **2. Literature Review**

To date, there have been a number of studies on the translation of nonstandard language varieties in literary works. In her studies of the translation of Cockney dialogues in *Pygmalion* into German, Perteghella (2012: 51) argues that nonstandard language varieties,

such as slang, regionalisms, and dialects, are very important in literary works because they define characters by “identifying them as members of specific geographical, social, economic, and political communities.” However, translators might adopt different strategies in handling translation of nonstandard language by taking several matters into consideration, such as target audience reception, political factors, unsuitable target language (TL) dialects, and/or the need to address a very specific target culture. On a similar note, Ramos Pinto (2009), in her study on Portuguese translations of *Pygmalion* and *My Fair Lady*, suggests that contextual factors, such as censorship, literary tradition, prestige linked with written and oral discourse, readership or audience design, and legibility, may affect translators’ decisions in addressing nonstandard language in literary texts. The study found that translations of literary texts intended for stage plays tend to pay more attention to the preservation of nonstandard language markers compared to literary texts intended to be published as books.

However, other studies such as the one conducted by Pitkäsalo (2016) found that preservation of nonstandard language varieties in the translation of novels has its own merits. In her study of Finnish and Hungarian translations of a novel originally written in Meänkieli, a Finnish dialect spoken in northern Sweden, Pitkäsalo (2016) argues that the use of standard language in Finnish translation rendered the narrator’s voice inauthentic and stiff since some features in standard Finnish are commonly perceived as the language of written discourse. However, she also noted that the same is not true for the Hungarian translation since in that language, differences between language varieties are mainly prosodic. Interestingly, Yu (2017) finds that while the use of vulgar and colloquial varieties of Chinese language works well to replace the nonstandard English in the Chinese translation of *The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn*, the same cannot be said with the use of standard variety of target language to replace the standard American English in the original work. This is because the two standard varieties carry different representations within their respective language community.

With regard to translators’ strategies in *Wuthering Heights* in particular, a number of studies have also been conducted. Pedersen (2014: 95) compared two Danish translations using different translation strategies and found one version to be more “elegant but not that accurate”, and the other more “accurate but not that elegant.” However, her study does not focus on dialect translation, but on general translation strategies and their impacts on translation quality. Nonetheless, she did briefly discuss the issue of dialect use in the source text (ST) and found that none of the Danish translations used nonstandard varieties in the target texts (TT) (2014: 22).

Caldeira (2015) compared between two Brazilian Portuguese translations of *Wuthering Heights* focusing on the translation of dialects, including Joseph’s speech. Caldeira found that the two translators applied different strategies in translating Joseph’s nonstandard language varieties. One version employs standardization as a strategy whereby the different language styles of the characters are no longer apparent in the translation. The other version retains the difference by utilizing the “redneck” Brazilian Portuguese language style to replace Yorkshire dialect markers in the source text (ST). The latter strategy might have been chosen because it not only retains variation of language styles among characters, but also carries an almost similar stereotype of speakers being “people who work in the field and [have] no access to formal education” (2015: 24). Following Caldeira, Ngo and Nguyen (2015) conducted a study on the Vietnamese translation of Joseph’s speech and found lexicalization to be the strategy opted by the translator. In this strategy, the markedness of one language is conveyed mostly through lexical items, rather than any other elements, such as phonological or morphosyntactic elements (Berezowski, 1997).

Despite a number of studies on translation of dialects or nonstandard language varieties in literary works, very few studies on Indonesian translation of such language varieties have been published. In fact, the researcher only found two studies on the Indonesian translations of English dialects in literary works to date. Dewi, Nababan, Santosa, and Djatmika (2016) investigate the Indonesian translation of the African-American Vernacular English in *The Adventures of Huckleberry Finn*. They find that the translation does not reflect the different varieties of language used in the original work since the translator opts to neutralize any nonstandard language markers. On the other hand, almost similar to the current study, Rahmawati (2018) investigates the translation of Yorkshire accent in James Herriot's *All Creatures Big and Small*. She finds that the Indonesian translator mostly standardized or omitted the nonstandard language elements while trying to maintain the markedness of Yorkshire farmers' language through the consistent use of lexical marker word "aye", borrowed from the SL.

Studies on the Indonesian translation of *Wuthering Heights* are also scarce. A study by Anggun (2012) focuses on the comparison on the translations of cultural words in the two Indonesian versions. Meanwhile, Widowati (2013) compares the translations of simile in both Indonesian versions. Finally, in the article which summarizes her master's thesis, Luciana (2014) investigates the general strategies applied by Lulu Wijaya, one of the two Indonesian translators of *Wuthering Heights* and the perceived quality of the said translation according to a number of readers. Nevertheless, there has been no study on the translation of nonstandard language used in the original English version of *Wuthering Heights*. In addition to providing a framework for future research on Indonesian translation of nonstandard language, this study will also fill in the gap as well as complement the previous studies on Indonesian translation of *Wuthering Heights* and of nonstandard language in literary works.

### **3. Theoretical Framework**

#### *3.1. Dialect Markers*

In her study of dialect translation involving nonstandard English and Chinese language varieties, Lung (2000: 268) suggested that translators must first consider whether the original source of nonstandard language expresses any social significance and whether any linguistic resource in the target language can achieve both semantic and stylistic adequacy in the translation.

This study focuses on a particular type of nonstandard language, namely dialect. Englund Dimitrova (2004: 123) notes that dialect in fictional prose is established through the following linguistic dialect markers:

- (1) Lexical markers or lexical elements, such as words or expressions, that do not belong to the codified standard language;
- (2) Phonological/orthographic markers comprising alternative spellings that also indicate pronunciation deviation from the standard;

- (3) Morphosyntactic markers, that is, morphology and/or syntactical structure that differs from the standard. Since every language has distinct sets of morphological and syntactical rules, morphosyntactic markers poses a great challenge for translators.

### 3.2. *Nonstandard Language Translation Strategies*

A number of translation strategies have been identified and offered to solve translation issues arising from use of nonstandard language in literary works.

In her studies on dialect translations in several European languages, Englund Dimitrova (1997) observed three general tendencies in the translation of dialects:

- (1) The tendency to be more normative than the source text or more in compliance with the codified standards of the target language;
- (2) The tendency to use fewer linguistic markers for a specific variety/register, if any, compared to the source text;
- (3) The tendency to use lexical markers instead of other dialect markers, such as phonological/orthographic or morphosyntactical markers.

In her later work, which also discusses translations of nonstandard language varieties in different European languages, Englund Dimitrova (2004: 134) found that when translators choose to translate nonstandard SL varieties by using nonstandard TL varieties, they may not choose to use any linguistic markers for any particular TL dialect. Instead, European translators tend to use colloquial markers to convey the markedness of the language used in the original work.

On a similar note, Perteghella (2012), who studies the German translation of Cockney dialogues in *Pygmalion* and the Italian translation of the play *Saved*, identified five textual strategies available for translators to address issues in translating nonstandard language, such as slang and dialect, in theater plays. The strategies include:

- (1) Dialect Compilation in which translators replace a dialect or slang language with a mixture of dialects or idioms known by target audiences while maintaining the play's original setting.
- (2) Pseudo-Dialect Translation in which translators make up a fictitious, vague dialect that may be composed of nonstandard language and idiomatic features of different regional dialects in the target culture, while maintaining proper names and topical or cultural references that exist in the source material.
- (3) Parallel Dialect Translation, which is replacing the original dialect or slang with a target culture dialect or slang that has similar connotations or an analogous position in the target culture's linguistic system. The translator may choose to keep proper names, topical jokes, and other cultural references from the original work.

- (4) Dialect Localization, that is, a domestication strategy in which translators localize a dialect from the original work into a specific dialect in the target culture. Proper names, topical jokes, settings, and other cultural references in the original work may be adapted into those more familiar to the target culture's audience.
- (5) Standardization refers to substitutions of dialect, slang, or jargon in the original work with standard language in the target culture. The translation avoids any domestic connotations while maintaining the setting and topical references from the original.

Although Perteghella (2012) originally identifies these five strategies for the translation of theater plays. I believe that they are also applicable to translation of other literary works that involve the occasional use of nonstandard language varieties in their narrative or dialogs.

#### **4. Methodology**

The data for this study is Joseph's dialogues in the novel *Wuthering Heights* and their Indonesian translations by A.R.B. Haryo published by Qanita Publishing in 2011. The analysis of Joseph's nonstandard language style in this study employs the dialect markers proposed by Englund Dimitrova (2004), namely lexical, phonological/orthographical, and morphosyntactic markers. Back translation from the Indonesian version to Standard English is provided to illustrate changes between the original English version and the Indonesian version from Qanita Publishing.

The analysis of the translation of lexical markers are divided into two parts. The first part focuses on the dialect words used by Joseph, while the second part focuses on the pronouns used by Joseph in his interactions with other characters. To conduct the first part of the analysis, this research makes use of the alphabetical list of Yorkshire dialect words in *Wuthering Heights* made by Wiltshire (2005: 28).

The discussion on the nonstandard language signified by phonological/orthographical markers focuses on the translation of the words uttered by Joseph in the source text which are not written in accordance with the standard spelling. The unconventional spellings are used in the text to indicate a particular way of pronouncing words, which is different from what perceived as the standard pronunciation.

Meanwhile, the last part of the analysis discusses how the translator deals with Joseph's nonstandard English signified by morphosyntactic markers. The focus of this part is the translation of Joseph's violation of the standard English grammatical rules, which distinguishes his way of talking compared to other characters and implies his lower social or educational background status.

Finally, a conclusion will be drawn from the results of the analysis in relation to the research questions. To identify the strategies employed by the translator, this study observes the application of any of the three tendencies in translating dialects suggested by Englund Dimitrova (1997). The study will then discern the benefits and/or drawbacks of the application of such strategies and the challenges the translator might face that require her to

choose one strategy over the others as well as those that made the translator mistranslates some particular dialect words.

## 5. Analysis

The translation of Joseph's nonstandard language is divided into three parts based on the dialect markers proposed by Englund Dimitrova (2004). The first part discusses the translation of the lexical markers, and it is followed by the discussion on the orthographical/phonological markers. Finally, the third part discusses the translation of the nonstandard English language originally indicated by morphosyntactic markers.

### 5.1. Lexical Markers

#### 5.1.1. Dialect Words

Wiltshire (2005: 28) has alphabetically listed the dialect words used mainly by Joseph in *Wuthering Heights*. Table 1 compares these dialect words and their translations in the Indonesian rendition published by Qanita Publishing. Some dialect words in Wiltshire's original list are not included either because the translator employed translation procedures that enabled her to avoid using such words, such as using omission strategies or paraphrasing, or because such words are not uttered by Joseph. The back translation to Standard English shows that the Indonesian translator used the standardization strategy.

Yorkshire Dialect Words	Standard English Words (Wiltshire 2005)	Indonesian Translation	Back Translation to Standard English
Barn	Child	<i>Peternakan</i>	<b>Farm (misinterpretation)</b>
Barthen	Shelter	<i>Beban</i>	<b>Burden (misinterpretation)</b>
Bide	Stay/Wait	<i>Tinggal</i>	Stay
Brust	Burst	<i>Patah</i>	Broken
Chimbley	Chimney	<i>Cerobong asap</i>	Chimney
Deaved	Deafened	<i>Hancur</i>	Destroyed
Faishion	Make/Dare	<i>Masih</i>	Still/Remain
Flaysome	Fearful	<i>Mengerikan</i>	Fearful
Flitting	Moving house	<i>Pergi</i>	Go/Leave
(This) Gait	(This) Way/Path	<i>Seperti ini</i>	Be like this
Girn	Snarl/Grimace	<i>"menyeringai"</i> (marked by the translator with quotation marks)	"Grin"
Guilp	Scum for porridge	<i>Susu</i>	Milk
Harried	Robbed	<i>Mengusik</i>	Disturb
Jocks	Food	<i>Minuman</i>	<b>Drink (misinterpretation)</b>

Laced	Flogged	<i>Mendapat hukuman cambuk</i>	Getting flogged
Laiking	Playing	<i>Bergurau</i>	Joking around
Laith	Barn	<i>Kandang biri-biri</i>	Sheep pen
Lugs	Ears	<i>Telinga</i>	Ears
Meeterly	Moderately	<i>Benar-benar</i>	Truly
Mells	Interferes	<i>Masuk</i>	Enter
Mun	Must	<i>Harus</i>	Must
Neive/Nave	Fist	<i>Kepalan tangan</i>	Fist
Ortherings	Orderings	<i>Perintah</i>	Order
Pawsed	Kicked	<i>Menendang</i>	Kick
Plisky	Mischief/Rage	<i>Naik pitam</i>	Enraged
Quean	Woman	<i>Gadis</i>	Girl/Maiden
Riven	Torn	<i>Menyobek</i>	Tear
Skift	Move quickly	<i>Kaget</i>	Shocked
Thrang	Busy	<b><i>Mabuk</i></b> <b><i>(unmarked,</i></b> <b><i>quotation marks in</i></b> <b><i>ST are omitted in</i></b> <b><i>TT)</i></b>	<b>Drunk</b> <b>(misinterpretation)</b>
War	Worse	<i>Makin menjengkelkan</i>	Getting more annoying

**Table 1.** Indonesian translations of dialect words in Joseph's dialogs in *Wuthering Heights*

Table 1 shows that almost all the dialect words are not translated into nonstandard Indonesian words. One interesting issue is the translation of the nonstandard words “girn” and “thrang.” These two dialectic words are notably marked by use of quotation marks when they are uttered by other characters doing an impression of Joseph’s nonstandard language style. In the Indonesian version, however, only the translation of “girn” (“*menyeringai*”) is marked in similar fashion. The word “girn” itself is a socially marked word in the source text since it is used exclusively by Joseph: two times in his own dialogs and one time by Isabella as a narrator when she is talking about Joseph’s language (“...he ‘girmed,’ as Joseph calls it”). On the other hand, the Indonesian word “*menyeringai*” is an expressive word not commonly used in daily, casual language. The Indonesian translator chose to keep the quotation marks when Isabella uttered it, implying that it characterizes Joseph’s language style. Notably, however, the Indonesian word itself is actually listed in the Indonesian language dictionary, making it a standard Indonesian word.

Meanwhile, the dialectical word “thrang” used by Nelly, the narrator, to quote what Joseph said previously (“He said Mrs. Linton was ‘thrang,’ and the master was not in.”) is mistranslated into “*mabuk*” (“drunk”). This mistake might be caused by the pronunciation of the two English words being perceived as very similar by some Indonesian speakers, causing the translator to interpret the dialect word as simply a nonstandard pronunciation of the standard word “drunk” instead of as an entirely different word. In addition to using standard language to translate dialect words, the translator opted to omit quotation marks in the translation, resulting in the loss of the implied markedness of Joseph’s language style.



Another example in which the Indonesian translation used an expression not commonly used in daily conversation is the translation of the dialect word “plisky.” The translator chose a metaphorical expression “*naik pitam*,” which is more commonly used in literary works and may signify the markedness of one’s language style if used in a daily conversation setting. Although one might argue that Indonesian translations of dialect words “plisky” and “girnèd” succeed in conveying the markedness of Joseph’s language to some degree, they fail to communicate implied information about Joseph’s sociocultural background: having rural identity, lacking social polish, and embracing old-fashioned ideas (Hodson 2016: 32). In fact, the use of Indonesian “*naik pitam*” and “*menyeringai*,” instead of implying Joseph’s dialectical language style, makes his character sound like an educated person who is quite familiar with literary language. While one can also argue that these choices are justifiable since Joseph reads his Bible and, on one occasion, even tells young Heathcliff and Catherine to read books, the original work does emphasize his particular background, especially through his socially marked language style.

Besides the mistranslation of the dialect word “thrang,” as previously discussed, the Indonesian rendition also suffers from some other mistranslations caused by similarity of dialectical words to more familiar Standard English words, either in terms of spelling or pronunciation. After all, for literary dialect to be a mere phonetic version of Standard English is not unusual (Pukari 2015: 5). First, the word “barn,” used about young Hareton (“...the barn was every bit as good as I”) was translated into “*peternakan*” (“farm”) because it has the same spelling as the Standard English word “barn”, indicating a farm building used as a shelter for cattle. Next, the dialect word “barthen,” which also refers to a shelter for cattle is translated into “*beban*” (“burden”). This mistranslation might have resulted from similar pronunciation of “burden” or its archaic form “burthen.”

One mistranslation, however, might have been caused by the author’s attempt to deduce the meaning based on contextual clues, rather than similarity in spelling or pronunciation. The translator chose the Standard Indonesian word “*minuman*” (“drink”), instead of “*makanan*” (“food”) to translate the word “jocks”, which most probably caused by the word “cellar”, popularly associated with the place to store wine, in the sentence (“...to get them jocks out o’ t’ maister’s cellar!”).

The use of dialect words as lexical markers presents a considerable challenge to the translator, mostly due to a few having some degree of similarity with more familiar Standard English words in terms of actual spellings or possible pronunciations. On a few occasions, the Indonesian translator failed to identify dialect words’ correct meaning and consequently misinterpreted and mistranslated them. Meanwhile, the standardization strategy was used in translating dialect words from Joseph’s speech, and as a result, the markedness of Joseph’s distinctive language style is not reflected in the lexical items in the Indonesian version.

### 5.1.2. Pronouns

In addition to dialect words, this paper also discusses use of pronouns as lexical dialect markers. In many languages, in fact, pronouns used by speakers to address themselves and/or their interlocutors can be used to identify dialects or registers of speech. For example, a Japanese speaker using the dialect word “*oman*” to address his/her interlocutor most probably comes from the Kôchi region (Lóránt 2014), while an Indonesian speaker using the dialect word “*awak*” to address the interlocutor would come from the West Sumatra region.

In addressing himself as a subject in the original *Wuthering Heights*, Joseph consistently uses the word “aw,” which is not a dialect word per se, but a dialect

orthographical marker to illustrate his pronunciation of the word “I.” The issue of orthographical markers is discussed below. In the meantime, the Indonesian version of Joseph’s speech almost always uses the more casual standard first-person pronoun “aku,” with occasional use of formal standard first-person pronoun “saya,” as in his earliest dialog with Mr. Lockwood and when he talks to Hindley.

The English version of the novel also indicates the power relations and degree of familiarity among the characters through alternation of second-person pronouns used in their dialogs. The familiar form of personal pronouns “thee,” “thou,” and “thy” are sometimes used instead of the politer forms, “you” and “your.” Wiltshire (2005: 21) notes that this constitutes “a further aspect of dialect speech that is faithfully reproduced...throughout *Wuthering Heights*.” In a passage in chapter XIII, Joseph alternates between the two forms, using the familiar form “thou” (pronounced “thah”) to address Hareton, while using “you” (pronounced “yah”) to address Isabella. Such alternations and the orthographical dialect markers attributed to them in this particular chapter are absent from the Indonesian version, where both words are translated into “kau.” Just like the case with the first-person pronoun, Joseph in the Indonesian version uses the more casual pronouns “kau” and “kamu” in most situations, except in his very first line when he addresses Mr. Lockwood with the formal pronoun “Anda.” On the other hand, the servant addresses Hindley as “Tuan” (“Master”) without any use of a second-person pronoun, as shown in the following excerpt from chapter IX:

[ST] If **Aw** wur **yah, maister**... (Brontë 1992: 62)

[TT] *Kalau saya jadi Tuan*... (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 153)

[BT] If **I** were **Master**...

From the discussion above, it can be concluded that pronouns used by Joseph throughout the Indonesian version do not constitute apparent dialect markers, nor do they establish the markedness of Joseph’s language style because the translator adopted the standardization strategy. Nevertheless, to some extent the translator tries to reflect the power relations or the degree of familiarity between Joseph and other characters through variations of pronouns, albeit not exactly the same as in the English source material.

## 5.2. Phonological/Orthographical Markers

Inarguably, the most apparent dialect marker in *Wuthering Heights* is the orthographical marker. As discussed previously, many Standard English words in Joseph’s speech are written in a nonstandard spelling, such as “Aw” instead of “I,” or “und” instead of “and,” to reflect pronunciation differing from that of conventional Standard English. This nonstandard orthography can sometimes lead readers to misinterpret words and cause translators to mistranslate. This situation can become more complicated, especially if the pronunciation of such nonstandard orthography is similar to that of other words, as in the case of “barthen” and “burden,” or if nonstandard spellings are similar to standard spellings of certain words, such as “war,” which in Joseph’s speech actually means “worse.” In translating these words, as with translation of pronouns, the Indonesian translator chose to use Standard Indonesian words without any alteration to their standard spellings.

In addition to some Standard English words, Joseph also pronounces Heathcliff’s name quite differently than the other characters. This is illustrated by a variation in spelling

every time the name occurs in Joseph's speech, "Hathecliff." This nonstandard spelling of Heathcliff's name is absent from the Indonesian version.

Next, one of the novel's most interesting scenes related to standard versus nonstandard language is in chapter XIII: Joseph makes fun of Isabella's manner of speaking when she asks for a room in which to have her supper. In this particular scene, besides Isabella's choice of the word "parlor," Joseph also mocks her pronunciation of "room" (Wiltshire 2005: 23), which differs from his own pronunciation "rahm." The following excerpts compare the English source text [ST] and the Indonesian target text [TT], along with its back translation [BT].

In the first excerpt, Isabella narrates her impression of the room Joseph first shows her:

[ST] The "**rahm**" was a kind of lumber-hole smelling strong of malt and grain; (Brontë 1992: 104)

[TT] *Yang ia sebut sebagai "**kamar**" adalah ruangan jorok dari kayu yang menebarkan bau gandum dan biji padi yang sangat menusuk;* (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 250)

[BT] What he called a "**room**" is a wooden dirty space that gives overpowering smells of wheat and rice seeds;

Here, the translator simply translates the orthographically marked item "rahm" into standard Indonesian "**kamar**" without any alteration to its spelling, while retaining the quotation marks, which originally served as a signal that the word is not Isabella's. The translator chose to explicate such information by adding the expression "what he called a. ..."

Next, Isabella complains and demands that he show her a bedroom instead, while using the standard pronunciation, reflected by standard spelling. There is little to discuss since there is practically no difference between the ST and the TT, both using standard language for the word "bedroom":

[ST] ...this is not a place to sleep in. I wish to see my **bedroom**. (Brontë 1992: 104)

[TT] *...ini bukan tempat yang layak untuk tidur. Aku ingin melihat **kamar tidurku**.* (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 250)

[BT] ...this is not a proper place to sleep in. I wish to see my **bedroom**.

However, it becomes interesting as, in the English version, Joseph then starts to mock Isabella's pronunciation that differs from his own.

[ST] "**Bed-rume!**" he repeated, in a tone of mockery. "Yah's see all t' **bed-rumes** thear is—yon's mine." (Brontë 1992: 104)

[TT] "**Kamar tidur!**" *ulanginya, dengan nada mengejek. "Kau sudah melihat semua **kamar tidur** yang ada—di bawah itu kamarku."* (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 250)

[BT] "**Bedroom!**" he repeated, in a tone of mockery. "You've seen all the **bedrooms** here—beyond there is my room."

Although both ST and TT use italics as orthographical clues to show the markedness of Isabella's language to Joseph, the Indonesian version could not convey the information that the difference mainly refers to the two characters' different pronunciations or accents. In the Indonesian version, rather than mocking Isabella's accent, the old servant seems annoyed by Isabella's idea of how a proper bedroom should look like.

Standardization strategy was also adopted to translate phonological/orthographical markers where alternative spellings are absent from the translation. This strategy prevents the translation from conveying the same social elements in the story, namely the contrasted language styles among characters from different social classes and their awareness of such difference.

### 5.3. Morphosyntactical Markers

In relation to morphosyntactical markers that show the markedness of Joseph's language, on some occasions, Joseph does not conform to Standard English grammatical rules, such as in the following two excerpts from chapter IX:

- (1) [ST] Aw **seed** young Linton, boath coming and going, and Aw **seed** yah'  
(Brontë 1992: 62)  
[TT] *Saya **melihat** Tuan Linton muda datang dan pergi, dan saya **melihat** kau,...* (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 153)  
[BT] I **see** young Mr. Linton come and go, and I **see** you...
- (2) [ST] Und hah isn't that nowt **comed** in frough th' field, be this time?  
(Brontë 1992: 59)  
[TT] *Kenapa pula si Orang Gagal belum juga **datang** dari ladang, hingga saat ini?* (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 147)  
[BT] And why hasn't that Failure of a Person **come** from the field, until this time?

In the source material, Joseph does not conform to English grammatical rules of the past irregular form, contributing to the markedness of his speech. Meanwhile, since Indonesian language does not have similar grammatical rules, where time frame affects the form of the verb, the original morphosyntactical dialect marker could not be replicated in the translation. In Indonesian, time frame is reflected by the adjective or adverb of time. In the two examples above, the Indonesian translator decided to use Standard Indonesian words that adhere to Indonesian grammatical rules without including any morphosyntactical hint that might reflect the markedness of Joseph's language in the original work.

For the Indonesian translation to replicate the same morphosyntatic marker to show a character's distinctive language style is almost impossible. In a rare case, however, the Indonesian version establishes the distinctiveness of Joseph's language compared to that of other characters. The translator uses the colloquial adverb of time "*lagi*" instead of the more formal "*sedang*," which is not reflected in the original English version. The adverb of time, used to show that an action or a situation is still in progress, is used in the second chapter during Joseph's early dialog with Mr. Lockwood.

[ST] Th' maister's dahn i' t' fowld. (Brontë 1992: 5)

[TT] Tuan *lagi* di bawah, di kandang biri-biri. (Brontë 1963 trans. 2011: 18)

[BT] Master is down below, in the sheep pen.

This actually shows it possible for the Indonesian translation to maintain the markedness of Joseph's language in a quite different way than in the English version. Rather than focusing on the use of dialect markers, the excerpt indicates that the markedness of Joseph's language can be established through use of words implying the colloquial, or informality, in the Indonesian language, as proposed by Englund Dimitrova (2004), by using the word "*lagi*" instead of "*sedang*." Nevertheless, the Indonesian version does not apply this consistently. In fact, as discussed previously, on some occasions, Joseph utters words commonly used in formal situations.

## 6. Conclusion

The analysis of nonstandard language markers used in the English and the Indonesian versions of *Wuthering Heights* revealed that the Indonesian translator working with Qanita Publishing mostly adopted the standardization strategy. Nonstandard language markers in the original work are not retained in any way in the Indonesian version, where lexical choices, word spellings, and morphosyntactical structures in Joseph's speech do not deviate from codified standards of Indonesian language.

In a few cases in the earliest part of the novel, the Indonesian translator seemed to try to maintain the markedness of Joseph's language style through use of colloquial markers, instead of using dialect markers as in the English version. According to Englund Dimitrova (2004), this strategy of using colloquial markers to convey the markedness of the language in the original is actually common in translating nonstandard languages. Nevertheless, the Indonesian translator did not apply this strategy consistently, and in fact, applies it only to Joseph's earliest dialog with Mr. Lockwood. Later in the novel, Joseph's manner of speech no longer differs from that of other characters. It is quite unfortunate since had the translator consistently applied the Indonesian colloquial markers in Joseph language, she may have been able to distinguish Joseph's way of talking and signify his social status, although in a slightly different way from the original.

The standardization strategy adopted by the Indonesian translator has its own benefit, mainly in terms of readability, especially compared to the original English version. This prevents readers from missing any of the narrative involving the old servant. The drawback, however, is loss of information, social critique, and characterization originally conveyed through Joseph's socially marked manner of speech. This result is similar to the two previous research on the Indonesian translation of the nonstandard English in literary works (Dewi et. al. 2016; Rahmawati 2018). Nonetheless, more research on the Indonesian translations of non-standard language in literary works will be necessary to find out whether the standardization strategy has become the standard practice carried out by translators or publishers in Indonesia. To begin with, as a follow up to the current study, a similar research on the other Indonesian version should be conducted, and a comparison between the results of such study and the current study should be drawn.

## Funding:

The author received financial support from Directorate of Research and Community Engagements of Universitas Indonesia under the 2017 PITTA research grant scheme for the research, authorship, and/or publication of this article.

## References:

- ANGGUN, Aurelia Bunga P.R. 2012. *Cultural words in two Indonesian versions of Emily Bronte's Wuthering Heights novel: a comparative study*. Student's Thesis, Universitas Negeri Jakarta, Indonesia.
- BRONTË, Emily. 1992. *Wuthering Heights*, Hertfordshire: Wordsworth Editions Limited.
- BRONTË, Emily. 1963. *Wuthering Heights*, New York: Macmillan; trans. by A.R.B. Haryo (2011) as *Wuthering Heights*, Bandung: Penerbit Qanita.
- BEREZOWSKI, Leszek. 1997. *Dialect in Translation*. Wrocław: Wydawnictwo Uniwersytetu Wrocławskiego. Available at [http://www.ifa.uni.wroc.pl/site\\_media/uploads/documents/publications/Dialect%20in%20translation.pdf](http://www.ifa.uni.wroc.pl/site_media/uploads/documents/publications/Dialect%20in%20translation.pdf) (accessed 16 February 2019).
- CALDEIRA, J. C. 2015. *'From 'Wuthering Heights' to 'Morro Dos Ventos Uivantes': A comparison between translations*. Master's Thesis, Federal University of Technology – Paraná, Brazil. Available at [http://repositorio.roca.utfpr.edu.br/jspui/bitstream/1/6641/1/CT\\_COLET\\_2015\\_1\\_04.pdf](http://repositorio.roca.utfpr.edu.br/jspui/bitstream/1/6641/1/CT_COLET_2015_1_04.pdf) (accessed 14 February 2018)
- DEWI, Ida Kusuma, NABABAN, M. R., SANTOSA, Riyadi, and DJATMIKA. 2016. Terjemahan dialek African American English dalam novel the Adventures of Huckleberry Finn. In: *Proceeding of International Prasasti III: Current Research in Linguistics* (395-403). Available at: <https://jurnal.uns.ac.id/prosidingprasasti/article/download/1548/1438> (Accessed 17 February 2019)
- ENGLUND DIMITROVA, Birgitta. 1997. "Translation of dialect in fictional prose - Vilhelm Moberg in Russian and English as a case in point", in J. Falk (ed) *Norm, Variation and Change in Language*, Stockholm: Almqvist & Wiksell International, 49-65. [Stockholm Studies in Modern Philology. N.S. 11].
- ENGLUND DIMITROVA, Birgitta. 2004. "Orality, literacy, reproduction of discourse and the translation of dialect." in I.Helin (ed) *Dialektübersetzung und Dialekte in Multimedia*, Frankfurt am Main: Peter Lang, 121-139.
- FERGUSON, S.L. 1998. Drawing fictional lines: dialect and narrative in the Victorian novel. *Style* 32 (1), 1-17. Available at <https://www.thefreelibrary.com/Drawing+fictional+lines%3a+dialect+and+narrative+in+the+Victorian+novel.-a054019319>. (Accessed: 17 May 2017)
- HODSON, J.L. 2016. Talking like a servant: what nineteenth century novels can tell us about the social history of the language. *Journal of Historical Sociolinguistics*, 2 (1). ISSN 2199-2908. Available at <http://eprints.whiterose.ac.uk/96246/3/Hodson.pdf> (Accessed: 16 May 2017)

- ILHEM, Mortad-Serir. 2013. Rhetorical use of literary dialect in English literature: from Chaucer to Shaw. *International Journal of English Language and Literature Studies*, Vol. 2 (2), 102-123. Available at [http://www.aessweb.com/pdf-files/ijells%202\(2\)102-123.pdf](http://www.aessweb.com/pdf-files/ijells%202(2)102-123.pdf) (Accessed: 12 May 2017)
- LÓRÁNT, Björn. 2015. *The lexicon of Kochi Japanese: a comparative analysis between Japanese natives and Japanese non-natives of Kochi*. Student's Thesis, University of Gothenburg, Sweden. Available at <http://hdl.handle.net/2077/38277> (Accessed: 20 June 2017)
- LUCIANA, Maria Lucia. 2014. Emily Brontë's Wuthering Heights in Indonesian version: Lulu Wijaya's translation strategies and inappropriateness explored. *Jurnal Pendidikan Humaniora*, Vol. 2 (2), pp. 118-124. Available at <http://journal.um.ac.id/index.php/jph/article/view/4451/933> (Accessed 17 February 2019)
- LUNG, Rachel. 2000. Non-standard language in translation. *Perspectives: Studies in Translatology*, 8(4), 267-274. Available at <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0907676X.2000.9961395> (Accessed: 14 May 2017)
- NGO, Thu Ha & NGUYEN, Ha My. 2015. Duong Tuong's dialect translation strategies of Joseph's speech in Wuthering Heights by Emily Bronte [abstract]. *Khóa luận tốt nghiệp*. Abstract Available at [http://repository.ulis.vnu.edu.vn/handle/ULIS\\_123456789/65](http://repository.ulis.vnu.edu.vn/handle/ULIS_123456789/65) (Accessed: 17 February 2018)
- PEDERSEN, Ida Wulf Skov. 2014. *Wuthering Heights and two Danish translations: a comparative analysis of two Danish translations of Wuthering Heights with focus on the two translators' choices regarding micro-strategies*. Master's Thesis, Aarhus University, Denmark.
- PERTEGHELLA, Manuella. 2012. Language and politics on stage: strategies for translating dialect and slang with references to Shaw's Pygmalion and Bond's Saved. *Translation Review* 64(1), 45-53.
- PITKÄSALO, Eliisa. 2016. Dialect or language – language politics behind translation strategies. *inTRAlinea Special Issue: The Translation of Dialects in Multimedia III*. Available at <http://www.intraline.org/specials/article/2182>. (Accessed: 7 February 2018)
- PUKARI, Mina. 2015. *The purpose of dialect in Charles Dickens's novel Great Expectations*. Student's Thesis, University of Oulu, Finland. Available at <http://jultika.oulu.fi/files/nbnfioulu-201602031111.pdf> (Accessed: 20 June 2017)
- RAHMAWATI, Maya. 2018. Representasi kelas sosial dalam terjemahan dialek Yorkshire pada novel All Creatures Big and Small karya James Herriot. *Jurnal Pendidikan UNSIKA Vol. 6 (1)*, 29-39.
- RAMOS PINTO, Sara. 2009. How important is the way you say it? A discussion on the translation of linguistic varieties. *Target* 21(2), 289-307.
- VARGHESE, L. M. 2012. Stylistic analysis of Emily Brontë's Wuthering Heights. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science* 2.5, 46-50.

- WIDOWATI, Canti. 2013. *A comparative analysis of strategies on translating simile in the novel entitled Wuthering Heights into two Bahasa Indonesia versions and quality of simile translation of both translation versions*. Student's Thesis, Universitas Sebelas Maret, Indonesia.
- WILTSHIRE, Irene. 2005. Speech in Wuthering Heights: Joseph's dialect and Charlotte's emendations. *Brontë Studies: The Journal of the Brontë Society* 30(1). 19–29. Available at <http://dx.doi.org/10.1179/147489304x18821> (Accessed: 16 May 2017)
- YU, Jing. 2017. Translating 'others' as 'us' in Huckleberry Finn: dialect, register and the heterogeneity of standard language. *Language and Literature*, 26(1), 54–65. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0963947016674131>

### **Author**

*Andika Wijaya*  
*Teaching Staff in English Study Program*  
*Department of Linguistics*  
*Faculty of Humanities*  
*Universitas Indonesia*  
*Email: andika.wijaya@ui.ac.id*

In SKASE Journal of Translation and Interpretation [online]. 2020, vol. 13, no. 1 [cit. 2020- 06-05]. Available online at [http://www.skase.sk/Volumes/JTI18/pdf\\_doc/03.pdf](http://www.skase.sk/Volumes/JTI18/pdf_doc/03.pdf). ISSN 1336- 7811.